

1 THE HONORABLE JOHN C. COUGHENOUR  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6

7 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
8 WESTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON  
9 AT SEATTLE

10 MICHELLE WISE, *individually and on behalf*  
11 *of all others similarly situated,*

12 Plaintiff,

13 v.

14 RING LLC,

15 Defendant.

16 CASE NO. C20-1298-JCC

17 ORDER

18 This matter comes before the Court on Defendant's motion to dismiss Plaintiff's first  
19 amended complaint ("FAC") and to strike class allegations (Dkt. No. 33). Having thoroughly  
20 considered the parties' briefing and the relevant record, the Court finds oral argument  
21 unnecessary and hereby DENIES the motion for the reasons explained herein.

22 **I. BACKGROUND**

23 Defendant Ring LLC ("Ring") is a subsidiary of Amazon; it develops and sells video  
24 doorbells and "stick up cams" (collectively "Ring cameras") to homeowners.<sup>1</sup> (Dkt. No. 21 at 2.)  
25 Ring cameras placed inside and outside the home can record live HD video and enable two-way  
26 communication between the homeowners and visitors. (*Id.*) Users also have the option to store  
and save video footage taken by video doorbells, which record when the doorbell detects motion

27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47  
48  
49  
50  
51  
52  
53  
54  
55  
56  
57  
58  
59  
60  
61  
62  
63  
64  
65  
66  
67  
68  
69  
70  
71  
72  
73  
74  
75  
76  
77  
78  
79  
80  
81  
82  
83  
84  
85  
86  
87  
88  
89  
90  
91  
92  
93  
94  
95  
96  
97  
98  
99  
100  
101  
102  
103  
104  
105  
106  
107  
108  
109  
110  
111  
112  
113  
114  
115  
116  
117  
118  
119  
120  
121  
122  
123  
124  
125  
126  
127  
128  
129  
130  
131  
132  
133  
134  
135  
136  
137  
138  
139  
140  
141  
142  
143  
144  
145  
146  
147  
148  
149  
150  
151  
152  
153  
154  
155  
156  
157  
158  
159  
160  
161  
162  
163  
164  
165  
166  
167  
168  
169  
170  
171  
172  
173  
174  
175  
176  
177  
178  
179  
180  
181  
182  
183  
184  
185  
186  
187  
188  
189  
190  
191  
192  
193  
194  
195  
196  
197  
198  
199  
200  
201  
202  
203  
204  
205  
206  
207  
208  
209  
210  
211  
212  
213  
214  
215  
216  
217  
218  
219  
220  
221  
222  
223  
224  
225  
226  
227  
228  
229  
230  
231  
232  
233  
234  
235  
236  
237  
238  
239  
240  
241  
242  
243  
244  
245  
246  
247  
248  
249  
250  
251  
252  
253  
254  
255  
256  
257  
258  
259  
260  
261  
262  
263  
264  
265  
266  
267  
268  
269  
270  
271  
272  
273  
274  
275  
276  
277  
278  
279  
280  
281  
282  
283  
284  
285  
286  
287  
288  
289  
290  
291  
292  
293  
294  
295  
296  
297  
298  
299  
300  
301  
302  
303  
304  
305  
306  
307  
308  
309  
310  
311  
312  
313  
314  
315  
316  
317  
318  
319  
320  
321  
322  
323  
324  
325  
326  
327  
328  
329  
330  
331  
332  
333  
334  
335  
336  
337  
338  
339  
340  
341  
342  
343  
344  
345  
346  
347  
348  
349  
350  
351  
352  
353  
354  
355  
356  
357  
358  
359  
360  
361  
362  
363  
364  
365  
366  
367  
368  
369  
370  
371  
372  
373  
374  
375  
376  
377  
378  
379  
380  
381  
382  
383  
384  
385  
386  
387  
388  
389  
390  
391  
392  
393  
394  
395  
396  
397  
398  
399  
400  
401  
402  
403  
404  
405  
406  
407  
408  
409  
410  
411  
412  
413  
414  
415  
416  
417  
418  
419  
420  
421  
422  
423  
424  
425  
426  
427  
428  
429  
430  
431  
432  
433  
434  
435  
436  
437  
438  
439  
440  
441  
442  
443  
444  
445  
446  
447  
448  
449  
450  
451  
452  
453  
454  
455  
456  
457  
458  
459  
460  
461  
462  
463  
464  
465  
466  
467  
468  
469  
470  
471  
472  
473  
474  
475  
476  
477  
478  
479  
480  
481  
482  
483  
484  
485  
486  
487  
488  
489  
490  
491  
492  
493  
494  
495  
496  
497  
498  
499  
500  
501  
502  
503  
504  
505  
506  
507  
508  
509  
510  
511  
512  
513  
514  
515  
516  
517  
518  
519  
520  
521  
522  
523  
524  
525  
526  
527  
528  
529  
530  
531  
532  
533  
534  
535  
536  
537  
538  
539  
540  
541  
542  
543  
544  
545  
546  
547  
548  
549  
550  
551  
552  
553  
554  
555  
556  
557  
558  
559  
5510  
5511  
5512  
5513  
5514  
5515  
5516  
5517  
5518  
5519  
5520  
5521  
5522  
5523  
5524  
5525  
5526  
5527  
5528  
5529  
5530  
5531  
5532  
5533  
5534  
5535  
5536  
5537  
5538  
5539  
55310  
55311  
55312  
55313  
55314  
55315  
55316  
55317  
55318  
55319  
55320  
55321  
55322  
55323  
55324  
55325  
55326  
55327  
55328  
55329  
55330  
55331  
55332  
55333  
55334  
55335  
55336  
55337  
55338  
55339  
55340  
55341  
55342  
55343  
55344  
55345  
55346  
55347  
55348  
55349  
55350  
55351  
55352  
55353  
55354  
55355  
55356  
55357  
55358  
55359  
55360  
55361  
55362  
55363  
55364  
55365  
55366  
55367  
55368  
55369  
55370  
55371  
55372  
55373  
55374  
55375  
55376  
55377  
55378  
55379  
55380  
55381  
55382  
55383  
55384  
55385  
55386  
55387  
55388  
55389  
55390  
55391  
55392  
55393  
55394  
55395  
55396  
55397  
55398  
55399  
553100  
553101  
553102  
553103  
553104  
553105  
553106  
553107  
553108  
553109  
553110  
553111  
553112  
553113  
553114  
553115  
553116  
553117  
553118  
553119  
553120  
553121  
553122  
553123  
553124  
553125  
553126  
553127  
553128  
553129  
553130  
553131  
553132  
553133  
553134  
553135  
553136  
553137  
553138  
553139  
553140  
553141  
553142  
553143  
553144  
553145  
553146  
553147  
553148  
553149  
553150  
553151  
553152  
553153  
553154  
553155  
553156  
553157  
553158  
553159  
553160  
553161  
553162  
553163  
553164  
553165  
553166  
553167  
553168  
553169  
553170  
553171  
553172  
553173  
553174  
553175  
553176  
553177  
553178  
553179  
553180  
553181  
553182  
553183  
553184  
553185  
553186  
553187  
553188  
553189  
553190  
553191  
553192  
553193  
553194  
553195  
553196  
553197  
553198  
553199  
553200  
553201  
553202  
553203  
553204  
553205  
553206  
553207  
553208  
553209  
553210  
553211  
553212  
553213  
553214  
553215  
553216  
553217  
553218  
553219  
553220  
553221  
553222  
553223  
553224  
553225  
553226  
553227  
553228  
553229  
5532210  
5532211  
5532212  
5532213  
5532214  
5532215  
5532216  
5532217  
5532218  
5532219  
5532220  
5532221  
5532222  
5532223  
5532224  
5532225  
5532226  
5532227  
5532228  
5532229  
55322210  
55322211  
55322212  
55322213  
55322214  
55322215  
55322216  
55322217  
55322218  
55322219  
55322220  
55322221  
55322222  
55322223  
55322224  
55322225  
55322226  
55322227  
55322228  
55322229  
553222210  
553222211  
553222212  
553222213  
553222214  
553222215  
553222216  
553222217  
553222218  
553222219  
553222220  
553222221  
553222222  
553222223  
553222224  
553222225  
553222226  
553222227  
553222228  
553222229  
5532222210  
5532222211  
5532222212  
5532222213  
5532222214  
5532222215  
5532222216  
5532222217  
5532222218  
5532222219  
5532222220  
5532222221  
5532222222  
5532222223  
5532222224  
5532222225  
5532222226  
5532222227  
5532222228  
5532222229  
55322222210  
55322222211  
55322222212  
55322222213  
55322222214  
55322222215  
55322222216  
55322222217  
55322222218  
55322222219  
55322222220  
55322222221  
55322222222  
55322222223  
55322222224  
55322222225  
55322222226  
55322222227  
55322222228  
55322222229  
553222222210  
553222222211  
553222222212  
553222222213  
553222222214  
553222222215  
553222222216  
553222222217  
553222222218  
553222222219  
553222222220  
553222222221  
553222222222  
553222222223  
553222222224  
553222222225  
553222222226  
553222222227  
553222222228  
553222222229  
5532222222210  
5532222222211  
5532222222212  
5532222222213  
5532222222214  
5532222222215  
5532222222216  
5532222222217  
5532222222218  
5532222222219  
5532222222220  
5532222222221  
5532222222222  
5532222222223  
5532222222224  
5532222222225  
5532222222226  
5532222222227  
5532222222228  
5532222222229  
55322222222210  
55322222222211  
55322222222212  
55322222222213  
55322222222214  
55322222222215  
55322222222216  
55322222222217  
55322222222218  
55322222222219  
55322222222220  
55322222222221  
55322222222222  
55322222222223  
55322222222224  
55322222222225  
55322222222226  
55322222222227  
55322222222228  
55322222222229  
553222222222210  
553222222222211  
553222222222212  
553222222222213  
553222222222214  
553222222222215  
553222222222216  
553222222222217  
553222222222218  
553222222222219  
553222222222220  
553222222222221  
553222222222222  
553222222222223  
553222222222224  
553222222222225  
553222222222226  
553222222222227  
553222222222228  
553222222222229  
5532222222222210  
5532222222222211  
5532222222222212  
5532222222222213  
5532222222222214  
5532222222222215  
5532222222222216  
5532222222222217  
5532222222222218  
5532222222222219  
5532222222222220  
5532222222222221  
5532222222222222  
5532222222222223  
5532222222222224  
5532222222222225  
5532222222222226  
5532222222222227  
5532222222222228  
5532222222222229  
55322222222222210  
55322222222222211  
55322222222222212  
55322222222222213  
55322222222222214  
55322222222222215  
55322222222222216  
55322222222222217  
55322222222222218  
55322222222222219  
55322222222222220  
55322222222222221  
55322222222222222  
55322222222222223  
55322222222222224  
55322222222222225  
55322222222222226  
55322222222222227  
55322222222222228  
55322222222222229  
553222222222222210  
553222222222222211  
553222222222222212  
553222222222222213  
553222222222222214  
553222222222222215  
553222222222222216  
553222222222222217  
553222222222222218  
553222222222222219  
553222222222222220  
553222222222222221  
553222222222222222  
553222222222222223  
553222222222222224  
553222222222222225  
553222222222222226  
553222222222222227  
553222222222222228  
553222222222222229  
5532222222222222210  
5532222222222222211  
5532222222222222212  
5532222222222222213  
5532222222222222214  
5532222222222222215  
5532222222222222216  
5532222222222222217  
5532222222222222218  
5532222222222222219  
5532222222222222220  
5532222222222222221  
5532222222222222222  
5532222222222222223  
5532222222222222224  
5532222222222222225  
5532222222222222226  
5532222222222222227  
5532222222222222228  
5532222222222222229  
55322222222222222210  
55322222222222222211  
55322222222222222212  
55322222222222222213  
55322222222222222214  
55322222222222222215  
55322222222222222216  
55322222222222222217  
55322222222222222218  
55322222222222222219  
55322222222222222220  
55322222222222222221  
55322222222222222222  
55322222222222222223  
55322222222222222224  
55322222222222222225  
55322222222222222226  
55322222222222222227  
55322222222222222228  
55322222222222222229  
553222222222222222210  
553222222222222222211  
553222222222222222212  
553222222222222222213  
553222222222222222214  
553222222222222222215  
553222222222222222216  
553222222222222222217  
553222222222222222218  
553222222222222222219  
553222222222222222220  
553222222222222222221  
553222222222222222222  
553222222222222222223  
553222222222222222224  
553222222222222222225  
553222222222222222226  
553222222222222222227  
553222222222222222228  
553222222222222222229  
5532222222222222222210  
5532222222222222222211  
5532222222222222222212  
5532222222222222222213  
5532222222222222222214  
5532222222222222222215  
5532222222222222222216  
5532222222222222222217  
5532222222222222222218  
5532222222222222222219  
5532222222222222222220  
5532222222222222222221  
5532222222222222222222  
5532222222222222222223  
5532222222222222222224  
5532222222222222222225  
5532222222222222222226  
5532222222222222222227  
5532222222222222222228  
5532222222222222222229  
55322222222222222222210  
55322222222222222222211  
55322222222222222222212  
55322222222222222222213  
55322222222222222222214  
55322222222222222222215  
55322222222222222222216  
55322222222222222222217  
55322222222222222222218  
55322222222222222222219  
55322222222222222222220  
55322222222222222222221  
55322222222222222222222  
55322222222222222222223  
55322222222222222222224  
55322222222222222222225  
55322222222222222222226  
55322222222222222222227  
55322222222222222222228  
55322222222222222222229  
553222222222222222222210  
553222222222222222222211  
553222222222222222222212  
553222222222222222222213  
553222222222222222222214  
553222222222222222222215  
553222222222222222222216  
553222222222222222222217  
553222222222222222222218  
553222222222222222222219  
553222222222222222222220  
553222222222222222222221  
553222222222222222222222  
55

1 or when visitors press the doorbell. (*Id.*) In 2018, Ring filed patent application material for a  
2 facial recognition system that would allow law enforcement and homeowners to upload photos  
3 of individuals to be matched against the faces of people walking by Ring Cameras. (*Id.*)

4 On October 16, 2020, Plaintiff filed the FAC, alleging violations of Sections 15(a) and  
5 15(b) of the Illinois Biometric Information Privacy Act, 740 ILCS 14/1 *et seq.* (“BIPA”). (*See id.*  
6 at 1, 18–21.) The FAC alleges that Ring violated the BIPA by collecting, storing, and using  
7 Plaintiff’s and other similarly-situated individuals’ biometric identifiers and biometric information  
8 without informed written consent. (*Id.*)

9 The BIPA provides robust protections for the biometric information of Illinois residents.  
10 *See* 740 ILCS 14/1 *et seq.* It protects individuals’ biometric information, which is “any  
11 information, regardless of how it is captured, converted, stored, or shared, based on an  
12 individual’s biometric identifier used to identify an individual.” *Id.* § 14/10. A biometric  
13 identifier is a personal feature that is unique to an individual, such as a “retina or iris scan,  
14 fingerprint, voiceprint, or scan of hand or face geometry” *Id.* Collectively, biometric identifiers  
15 and information are referred to as “biometrics.”

16 Section 15(a) requires that a private entity in possession of a biometric identifier or  
17 biometric information “develop a written policy, made available to the public, establishing a  
18 retention schedule and guidelines for permanently destroying biometric identifiers” and adhere to  
19 that policy. 740 ILCS 14/15(a). Section 15(b) prohibits private entities from collecting,  
20 capturing, or otherwise obtaining an individual’s biometric identifiers or biometric information  
21 without first informing them in writing. *Id.* § 14/15(b). Private entities are further prohibited  
22 from collecting and storing a person’s biometric data unless he or she first executes a written  
23 release. *Id.* § 14/15(b)(3).

24 Here, the relevant biometric identifiers are face templates. Face geometries are determined  
25 by facial points and counters, creating a resulting face template which could ostensibly be  
26 compared against other identified face templates to identify an individual. (Dkt. No. 21 at 7.)

1 Plaintiff asserts that Ring has used video footage collected from the Ring Cameras to improve its  
2 facial recognition technology, which it stores in an unencrypted format and allows staff around the  
3 world to process. (Dkt. No. 34 at 10.) Further, according to Plaintiff, Ring has created millions of  
4 face templates from Illinois residents whose faces were captured by Ring Cameras without  
5 obtaining the required consent. (*Id.*)

6 Plaintiff alleges that these actions violate Sections 15(a) and (b) of the BIPA, and  
7 proposes the following putative class, which expressly excludes any Illinois resident who has  
8 purchased a Ring Camera:

9 All Illinois residents who had their biometric identifiers, including scans of their  
10 facial geometry, collected, captured, received, or otherwise obtained by Ring from  
videos or other visual media captured by a Ring Camera.

11 (Dkt. No. 21 at 15.)

12 Ring moves to dismiss the FAC under Rule 12(b)(6), arguing Plaintiff fails to state a  
13 claim under BIPA because she does not allege any “biometric data” collected, captured, or  
14 possessed by Ring can be used to identify her. (*See* Dkt. No. 33.) In the alternative, Ring argues  
15 the class allegations should be stricken. (*Id.* at 6.)

## 16 **II. DISCUSSION**

### 17 **A. Motion to Dismiss**

#### 18 **1. Legal Standard**

19 To survive a Rule 12(b)(6) motion, “a complaint must contain sufficient factual matter,  
20 accepted as true, to state a claim to relief that is plausible on its face.” *Ashcroft v. Iqbal*, 556 U.S.  
21 662, 678 (2009) (citation omitted). A claim is facially plausible when the “plaintiff pleads factual  
22 content that allows the court to draw the reasonable inference that the defendant is liable for the  
23 misconduct alleged.” *Id.* at 678. When reviewing a Rule 12(b)(6) motion, the Court accepts  
24 factual allegations in the complaint as true and draws all reasonable inferences from those facts  
25 in favor of the nonmovant. *Vasquez v. Los Angeles Cnty.*, 487 F.3d 1246, 1249 (9th Cir. 2007).

## 2. The FAC Plausibly Alleges BIPA Violations

Ring argues, based on the class of bystanders with no contractual relationship to Ring, that the alleged face templates are not biometrics because “[a] mere ‘scan of hand or face geometry’ absent identifying information such as a name, address, or phone number tying that geometry to a person “does not implicate the risks the Illinois Legislature sought to mitigate.” (Dkt. No. 33 at 10.) Ring points out that generally, a Plaintiff has a relationship with the company it is suing for violations of BIPA, which means the company could ostensibly access their name, address, or contact information. (*Id.* citing *Patel v. Facebook, Inc.*, 932 F.3d 1264, 1268 (9th Cir. 2019) (affirming class certification of Facebook users who uploaded photos to Facebook).)

Courts are divided on the viability of BIPA claims to classes of nonusers. *See, e.g.*, *Monroy v. Shutterfly, Inc.*, 2017 WL 4099846, slip op. at 1 (N.D. Ill. 2017) (allowing putative BIPA class action to proceed to discovery); *Flores v. Motorola Sols., Inc.*, 2021 WL 232627, slip op. at 3 (N.D. Ill. 2021) (declining to adopt Defendant’s argument that Section 15(b) applies only where an entity has some relationship with the individual on a motion to dismiss); *Zellmer v. Facebook, Inc.*, 2022 WL 976981 slip op. at 3 (N.D. Cal. 2022) (granting summary judgment against Plaintiff on his 15(b) claim due to the implausibility of interpreting the Act to require notice to unknown nonusers).

In its notice of supplemental authority (Dkt. No. 41), Ring directs the Court to *Zellmer v. Facebook, Inc.*, which addressed a similar class of individuals to the one proposed by Plaintiff. See 2022 WL 976981 at 3. The *Zellmer* court concluded that the Illinois legislature had “clearly contemplated that BIPA would apply in situations where a business had at least some measure of knowing contact with and awareness of the people subject to biometric data collection.” *Id.* at 3. Thus, while Facebook was required to comply with the notice and consent requirements of Section 15(b) for its known users, Plaintiff Zellmer and the putative class presented no reasonable way for Facebook to notify and receive consent from all nonusers whose faces may be scanned in photos uploaded to its website. *Id.* at 3–4. It thus granted summary judgment on Zellmer’s Section 15(b)

1 claim to Facebook, allowing only the 15(a) claim regarding Facebook's written data retention  
 2 policies to proceed to trial. *Id.* at 5. But the court emphasized that its conclusion was "made on the  
 3 basis of the specific record before it, and may not apply in other circumstances." (*Id.*)

4 Ring's argument, if adopted, asks for a similar result. But here, unlike in *Zellmer*,  
 5 Plaintiff alleges that Ring is collecting face geometry from photos, processing these images for a  
 6 facial recognition database "with the ultimate goal of identifying people who can be 'tagged' as  
 7 safe or potentially suspicious visitors." (Dkt. No. 34 at 7.) Plaintiff believes Ring's patent  
 8 applications describe a system capable of immediately identifying individuals. (*Id.* at 11.)  
 9 Further, due to the need to comply with more stringent privacy regulations in the European  
 10 Union, "and because Ring has exclusive custody and control of the information about the visitors  
 11 to homes with the Camera, Plaintiff believes that Ring has the capacity to identify these visitors,  
 12 including Plaintiff and Class members." (*Id.*) The complaint further alleges that Ring partners with  
 13 law enforcement agencies to semi-automatically identify individuals based on face recognition. (*Id.*  
 14 at 13.) These allegations, if true, establish a means through which certain individuals are readily  
 15 known to Ring.

16 On a motion to dismiss, the Court cannot determine whether Ring has the capacity to identify  
 17 Plaintiff, or how far it has endeavored towards realizing the systems and technologies described by  
 18 Plaintiff and in patents. Taking all factual allegations as true, as the Court must, Plaintiff has  
 19 sufficiently pleaded to Ring notice of the claims against them. *Vasquez*, 487 F.3d at 1249.

20 **B. Motion To Strike Class Allegations is Premature**

21 Ring argues that "at a minimum the Court should strike all class allegations" in the FAC  
 22 because the class is unknowable. (Dkt. No. 33 at 6.) But, while some courts have held that Rule  
 23 12(f) provides a means of striking class allegations, *see, e.g.*, *Sanders v. Apple Inc.*, 672  
 24 F.Supp.2d 978, 991 (N.D. Cal. 2009), they are in the minority within the Ninth Circuit, *see, e.g.*,  
 25 *Mattson v. New Penn Fin., LLC*, 2018 WL 6735088, slip. op. at 2 (D. Or. 2018) (gathering Ninth  
 26 opinions), *report and recommendation adopted*, 2019 WL 123870 (D. Or. 2019). And Defendant

1 provides this Court with an inadequate rationale to stray from that norm in this instance. Given  
2 that some of the information necessary to support the class, as proposed, lies solely within  
3 Defendant's control, Plaintiff should be afforded the discovery necessary to fully develop her  
4 class allegations. *See Mantolete v. Bolger*, 767 F.2d 1416, 1424 (9th Cir.1985).

5 **III. CONCLUSION**

6 For the foregoing reasons, Defendant's motion to dismiss Plaintiff's first amended  
7 complaint and to strike class allegations (Dkt. No. 33) is DENIED.

8

9 DATED this 3rd day of August 2022.



10  
11 John C. Coughenour  
12 UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26